An Empirical Study of Affiliate Marketing Disclosures on YouTube and Pinterest

Arunesh Mathur, Arvind Narayanan, Marshini Chetty
Content Creators and Advertising

PALIN for 15% off your order!

http://themeleashow.com/blueapron
Guidelines & Regulation

**FTC’s Endorsement Guidelines**

**ASA’s Social Media Ads Guidelines**
Guidelines & Regulation: Enforcement

Social media stars face crackdown over money from brands

Instagram ‘influencers’ told to clarify paid-for ads, while health claims are taken down after advertising breaches

Consumer protection bodies in the UK and US are increasing their crackdown on Instagram “influencers”, in an attempt to rein in the big business being done covertly on social media.
Endorsements in Advertising

- Sponsored Content
- Affiliate Marketing
- Product Giveaways

Affiliate Marketing: A Primer

- Content Creator
- Merchant
- Affiliate Marketing Company
Affiliate Marketing: A Primer
Affiliate Marketing: A Primer

Content Creator

“These designer hanging planters are available for less than $200.”

Merchant

Affiliate Marketing Company

These designer hanging planters are available for less than $200.”
Affiliate Marketing: A Primer

Content Creator

“These designer hanging planters are available for less than $200.”

Merchant

Affiliate Marketing Company

These designer hanging planters are available for less than $200.”
Affiliate Marketing: A Primer

“These designer hanging planters are available for less than $200.”
Affiliate Marketing: A Primer

Content Creator

“These designer hanging planters are available for less than $200.”

Merchant

Affiliate Marketing Company

These designer hanging planters are available for less than $200.”
Affiliate Marketing: A Primer

Content Creator

“These designer hanging planters are available for less than $200.”

Merchant

Affiliate Marketing Company

These designer hanging planters are available for less than $200.”
Affiliate Marketing: A Primer

Content Creator

“These designer hanging planters are available for less than $200.”

Merchant

Affiliate Marketing Company

These designer hanging planters are available for less than $200.”
Affiliate Marketing: A Primer

“These designer hanging planters are available for less than $200.”
FTC’s Guidelines: Affiliate Marketing

1. What should the disclosure state?

- Consumers may not understand “Affiliate link”
- “I get commissions for purchases made through links in this post”

2. Where should the disclosures be placed?

- Near the affiliate link
Research Questions

1. How prevalent are disclosures in affiliate marketing content on social media platforms?

2. Are these disclosures compliant with the FTC’s endorsement guidelines?
Method: Data Collection
Method: Data Collection

Prefix Sampling

515,999 videos → 405,471 URLs [video description]

2,140,462 pins → 1,878,815 URLs [pin URL]
Method: Identifying Affiliate Links

1. No publicly available list of affiliate marketing companies and their URLs

2. Links may be cloaked:
   - http://amzn.to/2hhuk62
   - https://www.amazon.com/gp/product/B01N2XRCKP/ref=as_li_ss_tl?tag=r-a-site-20

3. Key observation: Affiliate links contain patterns
Method: Identifying Affiliate Links

- 405,471 URLs [video description]
- 1,878,815 URLs [pin URL]

URLs Resolved
- [3XX, Meta refresh]
- (~2.5% timed out)
# Method: Identifying Affiliate Links

- **405,471 URLs** [video description]
- **1,878,815 URLs** [pin URL]
- **URLs Resolved** [3XX, Meta refresh] [~2.5% timed out]

### URL Domain Count (Paths)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>URL Domain</th>
<th>Count (Paths)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>dpbolvw</td>
<td>150</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### URL Domain Count (Sub Domains)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>URL Domain</th>
<th>Count (Sub Domains)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>clickbank</td>
<td>678</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### URL Domain URL Parameter Count

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>URL Domain</th>
<th>URL Parameter</th>
<th>Count</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>amazon</td>
<td>tag</td>
<td>1724</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>aliexpress</td>
<td>af</td>
<td>1624</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Method: Identifying Affiliate Links

405,471 URLs [video description]

1,878,815 URLs [pin URL]

URLs Resolved
[3XX, Meta refresh] [~2.5% timed out]

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>URL Domain</th>
<th>Count (Paths)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>dpbolvw</td>
<td>150</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>URL Domain</th>
<th>Count (Sub Domains)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>clickbank</td>
<td>678</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>URL Domain</th>
<th>URL Parameter</th>
<th>Count</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>amazon</td>
<td>tag</td>
<td>1724</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>aliexpress</td>
<td>af</td>
<td>1624</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Manual Extraction

Affiliate Link Patterns
Method: Discovering Affiliate Disclosures

Videos with Affiliate Links

Pins with Affiliate Link
Method: Discovering Affiliate Disclosures

- Videos with Affiliate Links
- Pins with Affiliate Link
- Descriptions
Method: Discovering Affiliate Disclosures

- Videos with Affiliate Links
- Pins with Affiliate Link
- Descriptions
- Bag of Words
Method: Discovering Affiliate Disclosures

Videos with Affiliate Links → Descriptions → Bag of Words → Hierarchical Clustering

Pins with Affiliate Link → Bag of Words

Manual Extraction and Analysis of Disclosure Clusters
Results: Affiliate Marketing Companies

1. 57 Unique Affiliate URL Patterns from 33 Unique Affiliate Marketing Companies

2. AliExpress, Amazon, Ebay, RewardStyle, ShopStyle, ShareASale

Full List on GitHub
Results: Affiliate Marketing Content

- **People & Blogs**
- **Gaming**
- **Entertainment**
- **Music**
- **Film & Animation**
- **Travel & Events**
- **Howto & Style**
- **Science & Tech**

- **No category**
- **Animals**
- **Outdoors**
- **Design**
- **Sports**
- **Hair & Beauty**
- **Women’s Fashion**

Chart showing affiliate content percentage across various categories.
Results: Affiliate Marketing Content

3.61%
Results: Affiliate Marketing Content

- **YouTube**
  - Categories: People & Blogs, Gaming, Entertainment, Music, Film & Animation, Travel & Events, Howto & Style, Science & Tech
  - Howto & Style: 3.49%

- **Pinterest**
  - Categories: No category, Animals, Outdoors, Design, Sports, Hair & Beauty, Women’s Fashion
  - Hair & Beauty: 4.62%
Results: Affiliate Marketing Disclosures
Results: Affiliate Marketing Disclosures

10.49%

7.03%
Results: Affiliate Marketing Disclosures

Affiliate Link 7.02%
- Explanation 1.82%
  - Channel Support 2.44%
    - Affiliate Link 4.60%
    - Explanation 2.43%

"Affiliate links may be present above"
"This video contains affiliate links, which means that if you click on one of the links, I’ll receive a small commission"
"AMAZON LINK: (Bookmark this link to support the show for free!!!)"
"(aff link)"
"(This is an affiliate link and I receive a commission for the sales)"

10.49%
7.03%
Results: Affiliate Marketing Disclosures

Affiliate Link 7.02% “Affiliate links may be present above”

Explanation 1.82% “This video contains affiliate links, which means that if you click on one of the links, I’ll receive a small commission”

Channel Support 2.44% “AMAZON LINK: (Bookmark this link to support the show for free!!!)”

Affiliate Link 4.60% “(aff link)”

Explanation 2.43% “(This is an affiliate link and I receive a commission for the sales)”

10.49% 7.03%
Results: Affiliate Marketing Disclosures

1. Affiliate Link 7.02% “Affiliate links may be present above”
   - Explanation 1.82%
   - FTC deems inadequate
     - “This video contains affiliate links, which means that if you click on one of the links, I’ll receive a small commission”
   - Channel Support 2.44%
     - “AMAZON LINK: (Bookmark this link to support the show for free!!!)”

2. Affiliate Link 4.60% “(aff link)”
   - Explanation 2.43%
     - “(This is an affiliate link and I receive a commission for the sales)”
Results: Affiliate Marketing Disclosures

Affiliate Link 7.02% “Affiliate links may be present above”

Explanation 1.82% “This video contains affiliate links, which means that if you click on one of the links, I’ll receive a small commission”

Channel Support 2.44% “AMAZON LINK: (Bookmark this link to support the show for free!!!)”

Affiliate Link 4.60% “(aff link)”

Explanation 2.43% “(This is an affiliate link and I receive a commission for the sales)”

10.49% 7.03%
Results: Affiliate Marketing Disclosures

Affiliate Link 7.02% “Affiliate links may be present above”

Explanation 1.82% “This video contains affiliate links, which means that if you click on one of the links, I’ll receive a small commission”

Channel Support 2.44% “AMAZON LINK: (Bookmark this link to support the show for free!!!)”

Affiliate Link 4.60% “(aff link)”

FTC advocates using

Explanation 2.43% “(This is an affiliate link and I receive a commission for the sales)”
Results: Affiliate Marketing Disclosures

Affiliate Link: 7.02%
Explanation: 1.82%
Affiliate Link: 4.60%
Explanation: 2.43%
Channel Support: 2.44%

“Affiliate links may be present above”
“This video contains affiliate links, which means that if you click on one of the links, I’ll receive a small commission”
“(aff link)”
“(This is an affiliate link and I receive a commission for the sales)”

“AMAZON LINK: (Bookmark this link to support the show for free!!!)"
Implications: Understanding Content Creators

1. What explains the low prevalence of affiliate marketing disclosures?

2. Are content creators aware of the FTC’s endorsement guidelines?
Implications: Examining Affiliate Marketing Companies

1. Holding affiliate marketing companies accountable

- Only 3 out of 10 most prevalent companies in our dataset had disclosure requirements in their Terms of Service

---

Associates Program Operating Agreement

Updated: May 2, 2018. (Current Associates, see what’s changed.)

Welcome to Amazon's website for associates (the "Associates Site"), where you can manage your affiliate marketing relationship with Amazon Services LLC or any of its affiliate companies, as the case may be ("Amazon" or "us" or similar terms).

Any person or entity that participates or attempts to participate in our associate marketing program (the "Associates Program") or entity, "you", or an "Associate") must accept this Associates Operating Agreement (this "Agreement") without change. By registering the Associates Site, you agree to this Agreement, including the Program Policies (defined in Section 11), which are incorporated by reference (for example, our Associates Program Participation Requirements, Associates Program IP License, Associates Program Rules and Associates Program Trademark Guidelines). Please read them carefully.
Implications: Design Suggestions

1. Design affordances in social media platforms
   - Disclosures are limited by the character space available to them
   - Twitter: 280 characters, Pinterest: 500 characters

2. Role of Web Browsers
   - In-built tools to detect and highlight advertisements to users
Directions for Future Work

1. Extending analysis to other platforms
   • Instagram, Blogs, Common Crawl

2. User study with disclosures
   • Do users identify and interpret the disclosures being made?

3. Building browser extension to detect and highlight advertising content
Summary

Method:
1. We gathered:
   - ~ 0.5 million YouTube videos
   - ~ 2 million Pinterest pins
2. Extracted all embedded affiliate links
3. Extracted disclosures (if any) from these videos and pins

Results:
1. ~90% of all videos and pins with affiliate links do not disclose these links
2. ~2% of all disclosures are compliant with the FTC’s endorsement guidelines